Overview of Liability and Compensation Issues with Immunization of Pregnant Women

Anna Jacobs, J.D.
Attorney, Office of the General Counsel
Public Health Division
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services
Outline

I. History of vaccine liability
II. VICP overview
III. Maternal Immunization and VICP Case Law
IV. HHS interest in maternal immunization
History of Vaccine Liability

- Originally, handled in civil court system.
- All parties dissatisfied.
- Push for tort reform nationally.
- Congress responded with National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program (VICP).
VICP

• Federal, no-fault alternative to civil system.
• Provides compensation to “eligible petitioners” for vaccine related injuries and deaths caused by “covered vaccines.”
Covered Vaccines

• Vaccines recommended by the CDC for routine administration to children.
• Added to the Vaccine Injury Table by the Secretary of Health and Human Services.
• Effective on passage of excise tax.
List of Covered Vaccines

- Vaccines containing tetanus toxoid (e.g., DTaP, DTP, DT, Td, TT)
- Vaccines containing whole cell pertussis bacteria, extracted or partial cell pertussis bacteria, or specific pertussis antigen(s) (e.g., DTP, DTaP, P, DTP-Hib)
- Measles, mumps and rubella vaccine or any of its components (e.g., MMR, MR, M, R)
- Vaccines containing rubella virus (e.g., MMR, MR, R)
- Vaccines containing measles virus (e.g., MMR, MR, M)
- Vaccines containing polio live virus (OPV)
- Vaccines containing polio inactivated (e.g., IPV)
- Hepatitis B vaccines
- Hemophilus influenzae (type b polysaccharide conjugate vaccines)
- Varicella vaccine
- Rotavirus vaccine
- Pneumococcal conjugate vaccines
- Hepatitis A vaccines
- Trivalent influenza vaccines
- Meningococcal vaccines
- Human papillomavirus (HPV) vaccines
- Any new vaccine recommended by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention for routine administration to children, after publication by Secretary, HHS of a notice of coverage
Process

- Eligible individual must first file claim in the VICP against Secretary of Health and Human Services.

- Must prove:
  - Eligibility to file.
  - Sustained injury listed on Vaccine Injury Table (causation presumed) or off-Table (must prove causation).

- No fault.

- Manufacturer/administrator are not parties.
Forum

- U.S. Court of Federal Claims.
- Decided by Special Master (trial judge).
  - Not binding.
- Appealable to U.S. Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit and U.S. Supreme Court.
  - Binding.
Post-VICP

• Petitioner must accept or reject judgment.
• If accept, then matter is final.
• If reject, then can sue manufacturer or administrator in civil court (limitations).
Not Eligible?

• Not required to file in the VICP. May bring civil suit directly.

• If file in VICP and found ineligible, case is dismissed.
Maternal Immunization in the VICP

- Claims for mother’s own injuries.
- Claims for injuries to fetus.
Relevant Statutory Language

- Petitioner must prove “that the person who suffered such injury or who died...received a vaccine set forth in the Vaccine Injury Table or if such person did not receive such a vaccine, contracted polio, directly or indirectly, from another person who received an oral polio vaccine” 42 U.S.C. 300aa-11(c)(1)

- “Only one petition may be filed with respect to each administration of a vaccine.” 42 U.S.C. 300aa-11(b)(2)
VICP Cases

- VICP parties have not agreed on the meaning of these provisions.
- Special Masters have not come to a consensus.
  - Some say can bring *in utero* claim.
    - Interpret “received” broadly to match remedial nature of the statute.
  - Some say cannot bring *in utero* claim.
    - Interpret “received” narrowly. Expression of one indirect method (oral polio exception) is the exclusion of all other indirect methods (*in utero* receipt).
- One petition rule not widely addressed by special masters.
- No cases have reached the Federal Circuit. No binding precedent. Not settled one way or the other.
Issues with Coverage of Vaccines

- Vaccines under development (RSV, GBS), if approved, may only be exclusively recommended for pregnant women.
- Statute limits covered vaccines to vaccines that are “recommended for routine administration in children.”
- Potential to cover these vaccines?
HHS Interest in Maternal Immunization

- Influenza, Tdap
- Healthy people 2020 Goals
- Countermeasures Injury Compensation Program (CICP)
- NVAC, ACCV
CICP

• Provides compensation for injuries and deaths directly caused by the administration or use of “covered countermeasures” used in public health emergencies.

• HRSA exercised its broad authority under the Public Readiness and Preparedness Act to promulgate regulations to implement the CICP.

• Issued regulation that specifies a child can qualify as an injured countermeasure recipient if the child survives birth, and is born with, or later sustains, a covered injury as the direct result of the mother’s administration or use of a covered countermeasure during pregnancy. See 42 C.F.R. 110.3(n), and preamble discussion at 75 FR 63660.
Thank You.